TESTING A MODEL OF CLARITY OF SELF, ROLE, AND SYSTEM AS PREDICTORS OF JOB SATISFACTION OF NURSES IN JAMAICA

Presented by Pauline Anderson-Johnson (Jamaica) and John Nelson (USA)
OBJECTIVES

- Identify the social and technical facets of job satisfaction found within the island country of Jamaica
- Establish an understanding how clarity of self, role, and system relates to nursing staff creating a more satisfying and efficient job
AGENDA

- Background
- Methods
- Results
- Next steps
  - Operations
  - Research trajectory
BACKGROUND

- The University Hospital of the West Indies (UHWI) is a regional teaching hospital.
- It provides secondary and tertiary healthcare services both locally and regionally.
- It has a bed capacity of 600 including ICU beds of 16 and NICU of 23.
BACKGROUND

- The UWI was established in 1948 as a university college (UCWI) affiliated to the University of London.
- It is the oldest fully regional institution of higher learning in the Commonwealth Caribbean.
- It serves 18 English speaking countries and territories in the Caribbean.
BACKGROUND

- No study conducted at UWI for job satisfaction within all 48 units
- Opportunity to serve as site for studying both social and technical dimensions of job satisfaction
- Opportunity to learn the successes and vulnerabilities of each unit within nursing services
- Establish understanding how clarity of self, role, and system may impact job satisfaction
BACKGROUND

- Job satisfaction – literature review
  - Literature from 2006 to 2011 examined
  - 996 articles found the included “job satisfaction” and “nurse” in five databases
  - 164 articles selected for deeper review as they had identified a measure and addressed nurses specifically in the data
  - Inclusion criteria:
    - Nurse provide direct care, and could include charge nurse, ward sister, Registered Nurse and Enrolled Associate Nurse (EAN)
    - Part of regular staff within hospital
BACKGROUND

- Job satisfaction – sample size and techniques
  - There were 416,449 respondents. In 164 studies
  - Sample sizes ranged from 23 to 72,866 with a mean of 2,892 per study.
  - Most studies were:
    - Convenience samples (n=106),
    - Random sampling (n=20), and
    - Stratified sampling (n=11).
Job satisfaction – countries studied

There were 35 different countries identified

127 studies measuring nurse job satisfaction in only one country and the remainder studying job satisfaction in more than one country.

Countries studied:

The USA was the most commonly studied country (n=62)
followed by Canada (n=12),
China (n=8), and
Australia (n=7).

One Jamaican study found in 2001.
BACKGROUND

- Job satisfaction – nurse job titles studied
  - Roles studied
    - The most common respondent was “nurse” (n=55 studies) followed by
    - Nurses who work in hospitals (n=37).
    - Other types of nurse roles that were studied included mental health nurses (five studies), home health nurses (four studies), Intensive Care Unit (ICU) nurses (three studies), public health nurses (three studies), nurses and aides (two studies), nurses new to the profession (two studies), oncology nurses (two studies), and, “RN” (two studies).
    - There were 26 other various nurse roles considered in separate studies (e.g. nephrology nurse, quality assurance nurse, etc.)
Job satisfaction – definition

Thirty different definitions of job satisfaction. Job satisfaction has been defined as:

- a feeling, an attitude, liking one’s job, an affect, a positive affective orientation, an affective reaction, the sum of one’s cognitive and affective appraisals on one’s job, etc.

- No consensus on definition thus no consistently used measure for job satisfaction
BACKGROUND

- Job satisfaction – measures
  - Unidimensional
    - Single item or sum or items used to report one number representing job satisfaction
    - Eight single item measures found
    - Nine measures found that used a sum of scores
    - Strengths: short and easy to use
    - Weakness: over-simplified, prone to extreme scores, not useful operationally
Job satisfaction – measures
  Multidimensional – multiple items or constructs reported separately, proposed to comprise the latent variable of job satisfaction
    Thirty-one measures found for job satisfaction
    No measure found that performed the same across multiple sites
    Number of subscales per measure ranged from 2-30
    Average measure included 7.8 subscales
    Items per measure ranged from 12 to 180 with a mean of 74 items per measure
    Index of Work Satisfaction (IWS) by Slavitt, Stamps, Piedmont, & Haase, 1978
BACKGROUND

- Job satisfaction – measures
  - Multidimensional
  - Satisfaction with coworkers, measured in 21 of the 31 measures
  - There were 17 additional dimensions measured by four or more of the 31 measures
    - satisfaction with management (n = 19 measures),
    - compensation (n=14 measures),
    - workload (n=13 measures),
    - professional opportunities (n=11 measures),
    - policy and procedures (n=10 measures),
    - autonomy (n=9 measures),
    - nature of work (n=9 measures),
    - environment (n=9 measures),
Job satisfaction – measures

- Multidimensional (continued)
- There were 17 additional dimensions measured by four or more of the 31 measures (continued)
  - promotional opportunities (n=6 measures),
  - control over practice (n=6 measures),
  - staffing/resources (n=5 measures),
  - scheduling (n=5 measures),
  - praise and recognition (n=4 measures),
  - nurse-physician relationship (n=4 measures),
  - executive leadership (n=4 measures),
  - job security (n=4 measures), and
  - fringe benefits (n=4 measures).
- The remainder of the dimensions were included across three or fewer measures.
BACKGROUND
PROCEDURES

- Hard copy surveys were prepared for 632 staff on 48 units
- Measures (110 items)
  - Healthcare Environment Survey – 65 Likert scale items, 4 qualitative questions, 11 demographics (80 total)
  - Clarity of self – 12 Likert scale items
  - Clarity of role – 6 Likert scale items
  - Clarity of system – 12 Likert scale items
RESULTS

- Data is currently being collected for the final test
- Preliminary data (n=159, 25% of potential respondents)
- Sixty-two responded to all 110 items in all 4 surveys (10% of potential respondents)
RESULTS

- Chronbach’s alpha
  - Subscales of HES .81 - .95
  - Clarity of Self .86
  - Clarity of Role .84
  - Clarity of System .86
RESULTS, HES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Mean Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Professional Patient Care</td>
<td>4.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participative Management</td>
<td>4.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship w/Coworkers</td>
<td>4.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autonomy</td>
<td>4.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship w/Nurses</td>
<td>4.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workload</td>
<td>4.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive Leadership</td>
<td>4.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staffing &amp; Scheduling</td>
<td>4.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Healthcare Environment Survey II</td>
<td>3.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional Growth</td>
<td>3.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship w/Physicians</td>
<td>3.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resources</td>
<td>2.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distributive Justice</td>
<td>2.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(higher scores indicate more satisfaction)
RESULTS, CLARITY

- Clarity of System
  (1-7 scale, high scores = clarity)
- Clarity of Role
  (1-6 scale, high scores = clarity)
- Clarity of self-Concept
  (1-5 Scale, low scores=clarity)
## RESULTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>HES</th>
<th>Clarity of Self</th>
<th>Clarity of Role</th>
<th>Clarity of System</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HES</td>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clarity of Self</td>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.991</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>64</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clarity of Role</td>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.262</td>
<td>-.265</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.040</td>
<td>.004</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>116</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clarity of System</td>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.211</td>
<td>-.106</td>
<td>.362</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.091</td>
<td>.260</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
RESULTS

[Diagram showing the relationship between personal demographics, clarity of self-concept, clarity of role, clarity of system, and professional demographics leading to job satisfaction.]

© John Nelson, 2011
RESULTS

- Personal demographics
  - Dummy coded
  - Spearman’s correlation
  - Only marital status had a statistically significant relationship with Clarity of System ($r = 0.279$, $p = 0.004$)
  - Non-partnered staff had greater clarity of self
  - No other demographics correlated with any variable in the model
RESULTS

- Professional demographics
  - Dummy coded
  - Spearman’s correlation
- Job satisfaction
  - Number of years in nursing (r .310, p .015). Nurses with more years more satisfied
  - Number of hours worked per week (r -.278, p .022). Nurses with less hours more satisfied
- Clarity of self
  - Number of education hours per year (r -.215, p .048)). Those with more education hours more clarity of self
RESULTS

![Diagram showing a flowchart with nodes labeled Personal Demographics, Clarity of Self-Concept, Clarity of Role, Clarity of System, Professional Demographics (number of continuing ed courses/year), and Professional Demographics (years of professional experience, number of hours worked/week) leading to the node Job Satisfaction. The Job Satisfaction node branches to Social: RN, MD, non-RN/MD, PM, PPC and Technical: PG, WL, Auto, EL, DJ, Sched, Resources.)
RESULTS, STAY
RESULTS, LEAVE

- Pay/Benefits
- Management
- Coworkers
- Materials needed
- Workload
- Recognition
- Attitudes/Respect
- Miscellaneous
- Professional growth
- Nothing
- Autonomy
- Environment
- Hours/Shift
- Stress
- Work itself
- Fairness

Percent
RESULTS, STRESS

What creates the most stress in my job

Environment
Attitudes/Respect
Recognition
Hours/Shift
Miscellaneous
Pay/Benefits
Management
Coworkers
Workload
Resources

Percent

0.0% 10.0% 20.0% 30.0% 40.0%
RESULTS, ENJOY

What aspect of my job do I enjoy the most

- Nothing
- Pay/Benefits
- Work itself
- Autonomy
- Accomplishment
- Professional growth
- Recognition
- Miscellaneous
- Coworkers
- Patient

Percent
NEXT STEPS

- Finish study and test model
- Present data to staff for reflection and interpretation.
- Propose a second model for year two, based on baseline study, feedback from staff, and use of theory.
THANK YOU